

KCCA Boroondara Election Scorecards – Process and Scoring

The Kooyong Climate Change Alliance scorecards for the 2024 Boroondara Council elections (one for each ward) are focused on candidates' views and policies on climate action, but also cover Council transparency and accountability. The assessment of candidates is based on their responses to a detailed questionnaire. For sitting Councillors seeking re-election, an additional assessment of their voting record on climate issues is included.

1. The Questionnaire

The questionnaire consists of five sections:

1. Climate Leadership and Advocacy
2. Policies and Actions on Council Emissions
3. Policies and Actions on Community Emissions
4. Policies and Actions on Community Resilience and Adaptation
5. Policies and Actions on Council Accountability and Democratic Processes

There are four questions in sections 1, 2 and 4, six in section 3 and five in section 5. All questions require a 'Yes', 'Maybe' or 'No' answer. However, candidates were also given the opportunity to provide comments or explanations of their answers in each section and an overall statement.

A blank questionnaire and the full responses provided by each candidate are available on the website.

2. The Process

A total of 38 candidates are contesting the election. Questionnaires were emailed to candidates progressively as soon as their candidacy and contact details were known, starting with 24 candidates on 27 August 2024. The formal nomination period for candidates was from 9 September to 17 September, and the final three questionnaires were emailed on the final day of nominations, when the VEC published the final candidates' details. Two candidates did not provide contact details to the VEC and were not sent a questionnaire (David Dawson in Bellevue and Kym Sullivan in Studley).

The candidates contacted early in the process were asked to respond within two weeks. This period was reduced to a minimum of one week for candidates contacted later to allow sufficient time for scorecard production prior to the VEC mail out of ballots to voters. Four candidates responded to indicate they would not be completing the questionnaire. All candidates who did not respond received at least two reminders, except for the final four, who received one. All were offered an extension of time of up to one week, and were invited to discuss any difficulties with timing (or other issues with the questionnaire).

All candidates were advised that candidates who did not complete the questionnaire would be shown on the scorecard as having failed to respond.

3. Scoring the Candidates

A panel of three members of the Alliance carried out the scoring. Every questionnaire was scored by at least two members of the panel, and the results reconciled.

Candidates were given a score of 'Good', 'Fair/Maybe' or 'Poor' for each section in the questionnaire. The scores were based on answers to the questions alone. However, internet searches were undertaken to identify material published by candidates, which was checked for consistency with candidates' answers. Consistency with any comments provided in the questionnaire response was also checked. No significant discrepancies were identified.

Scores for each questionnaire section were assigned as follows:

- **Good:** 'Yes' answers to all questions
- **Fair/Maybe:** At least one 'Yes' answer (but not all) AND
Among the remainder, any 'No' balanced by a 'Yes'
- **Poor:** All other combinations i.e.
No 'Yes' answers (with any number of 'No' or 'Maybe') OR
If any 'Yes' answers, each one balanced by a 'No'
- **Failed to Respond:** Questions not answered

4. Current Councillors' Record

Sitting Councillors are re-contesting the election in eight wards: Cotham, Gardiner, Glenferrie, Junction, Lynden, Maling, Maranoa and Studley. The voting record of these Councillors on climate issues was assessed and is recorded on the scorecards.

All motions considered by the Council at full Council meetings, Services Delegated Committee meetings or Urban Planning Delegated meetings from 2021 to 2024 were reviewed, and four key climate-related motions were identified:

- Endorsement of the draft Climate Action Plan for community consultation at the Council meeting of 28 June 2021;
- Declaration of a climate emergency and adoption of the Climate Action Plan and the Implementation Plan 2021–2023 at the Council meeting of 27 September 2021;
- Provision of support for the Electrify Boroondara Alliance (including promotional material, attendance of nominated Councillors at meetings and consideration of resourcing requests) at the Services Delegated Committee on 20 March 2023; and
- Adoption of the Climate Action Plan Implementation Plan 2023-24 – 2024-25 at the Services Delegated Committee on 13 November 2023.

The votes of the relevant Councillors on these motions were determined from the meeting minutes (when a division was called) or by viewing the video recording of the meeting, and are summarised in the following table:

<i>Key Climate-Related Motions</i>	Felicity Sinfield	Victor Franco	Wes Gault	Di Gillies	Lisa Hollingsworth	Jane Addis	Cynthia Watson	Nick Stavrou
	Cotham	Gardiner	Glenferrie	Junction	Lynden	Maling	Maranoa	Studley
1. Endorse draft Climate Action Plan (CAP)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2. Declare a Climate Emergency & adopt CAP	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No
3. Support Electrify Boroondara Alliance	Yes	Apology*	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes
4. Adopt CAP Implementation Plan	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

* Not present at the meeting; however, Cr Franco has supported Electrify Boroondara and serves as one of the Councillor representatives on the Electrify Boroondara Alliance Advisory Group.

For the scorecards, each Councillor's record was rated as 'Good', 'Fair' or 'Poor' as follows:

- **Good:** voted for all of the key motions when present at the relevant meeting
- **Fair:** voted against one of the motions when present
- **Poor:** voted against two or more of the motions when present